

Judicial Performance Evaluation Reports

Fauquier County Judges Rank at Bottom of Official Judicial Evaluations!

Virginia Code § 17.1-100 requires that “By December 1 of each year, the Supreme Court, or its designee, shall transmit a report of the evaluation in the final year of the term of each justice and judge whose term expires during the next session of the General Assembly to the Chairmen of the House and Senate Committees for Courts of Justice.”

On December 1, 2016, the Executive Secretary of the Virginia Supreme Court submitted evaluation reports for 27 judges eligible for reelection during the 2017 session of the General Assembly.¹ Three judges from the 20th Circuit in Fauquier County are eligible for reelection and received evaluations, namely Judge Jeffrey W. Parker of the Circuit Court, Judge J. Gregory Ashwell of the District Court, and Judge Pamela L. Brooks of the Juvenile and Domestic Relations District Court. These judges received poor ratings compared to other judges eligible for reappointment. As shown in the attached, **each of these judges ranked LAST in performance compared to their peers being considered for reappointment.**

Fauquier County deserves better judges than this!

**Judicial Performance Evaluation Reports
Pursuant to Virginia Code § 17.1-100**

**Overall Performance Ratings—2016
(for Judges being considered for reappointment in January 2017)**

Rank	Judge	Circuit	Combined rating	Excellent	Good
1	John R. Doyle III*	4 th	100.0	89.6	10.4
2	Thomas W. Carpenter***	7 th	100.0	89.0	11.0
3	C. Randall Lowe*	28 th	98.4	89.2	9.2
4	James J. O'Connell III**	12 th	97.8	82.1	15.7
5	Julian W. Johnson***	15 th	97.6	77.1	20.5
6	Rufus A. Banks, Jr.***	1 st	97.2	87.4	9.8
7	William T. Newman, Jr.*	17 th	97.2	78.4	18.8
8	James R. Swanson*	23 rd	96.9	83.0	13.9
9	Jerrauld C. Jones*	4 th	96.4	85.4	11.0
10	Bonnie L. Jones*	8 th	96.0	70.7	25.3
11	Alfred W. Bates III**	5 th	95.8	75.8	20.0
12	Paul A. Tucker***	25 th	95.7	67.4	28.3
13	Joseph W. Milam Jr.*	22 nd	95.7	74.1	21.6
14	Michael Joseph Cassidy**	19 th	95.0	68.7	26.3
15	Charles S. Sharp*	15 th	94.2	83.4	10.8
16	Craig D. Johnston*	31 st	93.8	76.6	17.2
17	Timothy J. Hauler*	12 th	93.3	78.0	15.3
18	Shannon O. Hoehl***	15 th	92.9	68.8	24.1
19	M. Randolph Carlson II***	4 th	92.6	65.4	27.2
20	Jan L. Brodie*	19 th	92.2	69.3	22.9
21	Mary Jane Hall*	4 th	92.1	71.8	20.3
22	Larry D. Willis, Sr.***	1 st	91.7	62.5	29.2
23	Constance H. Frogale***	18 th	90.6	68.9	21.7
24	Leslie L. Lilley*	2 nd	88.6	54.4	34.2
25	Jeffrey W. Parker*	20 th	87.0	55.6	31.4
26	J. Gregory Ashwell**	20 th	86.1	55.7	30.4
27	Pamela L. Brooks***	20 th	67.3	41.4	25.9

* Circuit Court Judge

** District Court Judge

*** Juvenile and Domestic Relations District Court Judge

2016 Ratings for Judge Jeffrey W. Parker

Judge Jeffrey Parker ranks **LAST** in overall performance among circuit court judges currently being considered for reappointment by the General Assembly.

Among the 25 circuit court judges who have been officially evaluated for reappointment in the past three years, Judge Parker ranks 23rd.

155 attorneys and jurors submitted reviews of Judge Parker. Of these, only 56 percent found that he displays knowledge of the law every time, only 58 percent found that he is faithful to the law every time, only 54 percent found that he allows lawyers appropriate latitude in presenting their case every time, and only 58 percent found that he exhibits fairness to all parties every time. Only 55.6 percent rated Judge Parker’s overall performance as “excellent.”

Rating category:	Every time:
The judge displays patience in the courtroom	39.0%
The judge is courteous in the courtroom	52.9%
The judge is conscientious in the performance of judicial duties	63.4%
The judge is diligent in the performance of judicial duties	65.7%
The judge shows respect for all court participants	57.4%
The judge requires court participants to display respect toward one another	64.3%
The judge is attentive to the proceedings	67.7%
The judge exhibits fairness to all parties	58.4%
The judge treats all parties in an impartial manner	59.5%
The judge avoids inappropriate ex parte communications	76.3%
The judge maintains order in the courtroom	72.7%
The judge expects professional behavior of court participants	74.8%
The judge allows lawyers appropriate latitude in presentation of their case	53.6%
The judge displays knowledge of the law	56.3%
The judge is faithful to the law	58.0%
The judge communicates effectively	63.9%
The judge is prompt in rendering decisions	62.8%
The judge’s decisions are clear	61.7%
The judge performs judicial duties without bias or prejudice	64.0%
The judge starts court on time	67.6%
The judge uses courtroom time efficiently	65.8%

Overall performance—only 55.6% rated Judge Parker’s performance as “excellent”

**Judicial Performance Evaluation Reports
Pursuant to Virginia Code § 17.1-100
Overall Performance Ratings of Judges 2014-2016**

Circuit Court Judge Rank	Judge	Circuit	Combined rating	Excellent	Good
1	John R. Doyle III*	4 th	100.0	89.6	10.4
	Thomas W. Carpenter***	7 th	100.0	89.0	11.0
	Jacqueline F. Ward Talevi**	23 rd	100.0	90.4	9.6
	Gino W. Williams**	27 th	100.0	91.7	8.3
2	C. Randall Lowe*	28 th	98.4	89.2	9.2
	Gary A. Mills**	7 th	98.3	77.3	21.0
	Marvin H. Dunkum***	10 th	98.0	74.8	23.2
	Stuart L. Williams, Jr***	14 th	96.3	68.9	27.4
3	Robert M. D. Turk*	27 th	98.0	83.9	14.1
	Gene A. Woolard**	2 nd	98.0	90.1	7.9
	Robert C. Viar, Jr.***	27 th	97.9	87.5	10.4
4	Dennis Lee Hupp*	26 th	97.9	85.8	12.1
	James J. O'Connell III**	12 th	97.8	82.1	15.7
	Julian W. Johnson***	15 th	97.6	77.1	20.5
	Rufus A. Banks, Jr.***	1 st	97.2	87.4	9.8
5	William T. Newman, Jr.*	17 th	97.2	78.4	18.8
	Morton V. Whitlow**	3 rd	96.9	90.6	6.3
6	James R. Swanson*	23 rd	96.9	83.0	13.9
7	Burke F. McCahill*	20 th	96.6	79.8	16.8
8	Jerrauld C. Jones*	4 th	96.4	85.4	11.0
9	Bonnie L. Jones*	8 th	96.0	70.7	25.3
10	Gordon F. Willis*	15 th	95.9	72.4	23.5
11	Leslie M. Osborn*	10 th	95.9	80.6	15.3
	Alfred W. Bates III**	5 th	95.8	75.8	20.0
	Paul A. Tucker***	25 th	95.7	67.4	28.3
	Joseph W. Milam Jr.*	22 nd	95.7	74.1	21.6
12	Michael Joseph Cassidy**	19 th	95.0	68.7	26.3
	Deborah V. Bryan***	2 nd	94.3	86.9	7.4
	Charles S. Sharp*	15 th	94.2	83.4	10.8
14	Gary A. Hicks*	14 th	94.0	72.8	21.2
15	Bruce D. White*	19 th	95.9	78.0	17.9
16	Craig D. Johnston*	31 st	93.8	76.6	17.2
17	Timothy J. Hauler*	12 th	93.3	78.0	15.3
	Shannon O. Hoehl***	15 th	92.9	68.8	24.1
	M. Randolph Carlson II***	4 th	92.6	65.4	27.2
18	Jan L. Brodie*	19 th	92.2	69.3	22.9
19	Mary Jane Hall*	4 th	92.1	71.8	20.3
	Deborah L. Rawls***	2 nd	92.1	66.9	25.2

	Larry D. Willis, Sr.***	1 st	91.7	62.5	29.2
20	Cheryl V. Higgins*	16 th	91.3	69.6	21.7
	Randal J. Duncan**	27 th	90.7	72.7	18.0
	Elizabeth Kellas Burton***	26 th	90.6	79.7	10.9
	Constance H. Frogale***	18 th	90.6	68.9	21.7
	Charles H. Warren**	10 th	89.4	65.2	24.2
	Judith Anne Kline***	7 th	89.9	66.9	23.0
	Bruce A. Wilcox**	4 th	89.9	66.7	23.2
	William J. Minor, Jr.**	19 th	89.6	65.2	24.4
	Dale M. Wiley***	22 nd	89.2	43.5	45.7
21	A. Bonwill Shockley*	2 nd	88.8	70.9	17.9
	S. Anderson Nelson***	10 th	88.5	67.1	21.4
22	Leslie L. Lilley*	2 nd	88.6	54.4	34.2
23	Jeffrey W. Parker*	20th	87.0	55.6	31.4
	J. Gregory Ashwell**	20 th	86.1	55.7	30.4
	Gordon F. Saunders**	25 th	85.7	62.3	23.4
	Joseph P. Massey***	4 th	85.3	50.0	35.3
	Ronald Everett Bensten***	7 th	85.3	53.9	31.4
	David Eugene Cheek, Sr.**	13 th	85.0	63.9	21.1
24	Robert J. Smith*	19 th	83.2	54.5	28.7
	Becky J. Moore**	18 th	82.8	70.9	11.9
	Jacqueline R. Waymack ***	6 th	80.6	37.3	43.3
	David L. Williams** ×	1 st	79.4	37.2	42.2
	Colleen K. Killilea**	9 th	77.1	41.0	36.1
	George D. Varoutsos***	17 th	76.8	47.2	29.6
	Mitchell I. Mutnick**	19 th	75.9	48.1	27.8
25	Alfred O. Masters, Jr.* ×	7 th	73.7	36.4	37.3
	Pamela L. Brooks***	20 th	67.3	41.4	25.10
	Pamela E. Hutchens** ×	2 nd	65.5	35.9	29.6
	George C. Fairbanks, IV***	9 th	64.7	38.4	26.3
	Birdie Hairston Jamison** ×	13 th	55.8	22.5	33.3

* Circuit Court Judge

** District Court Judge

*** Juvenile and Domestic Relations District Court Judge

× not reappointed